**TEMPLATE FOR EVALUATING A SCIENTIFIC PAPER**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Paper Title |  |
| Authors |  |
| Date |  |
| Reference (journal title, volume page numbers) |  |
| How recent is the paper? |  |
| Has the paper been peer reviewed? |  |
| Is it a high impact journal? |  |
| Is there any declaration of interest? |  |
| **Overview** |  |
| What is the research question? |  |
| Why is it important? |  |
| What was the main experimental/data collection method? |  |
| What were the main findings? |  |
| What is the significance of the findings? |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Comments** | **Text location for evidence** |
| **Introduction** |  |  |
| Is there a clear background to the study in the context of current literature? |  |  |
| What is the question to be addressed, is it clearly identified? |  |  |
| Do the authors explain why the research was done? |  |  |
| Is there a clear hypothesis being tested? |  |  |
| **Methods** |  |  |
| Is there a full description of how the experiments/observations were undertaken and the data collected? |  |  |
| Are the protocols used referenced? |  |  |
| Are any modifications fully described and justified? |  |  |
| Are any limitations identified and allowed for? |  |  |
| What statistical methods were used and why? |  |  |
| Has ethical approval been granted (if required)? |  |  |
| **Results** |  |  |
| Are the results clearly described and presented through text, tables and figures? |  |  |
| Do the data presented in the tables and figures support the statements of findings made in the text? |  |  |
| Do the statistical analyses support the statements of findings made in the text? |  |  |
| **Discussion** |  |  |
| Are the results effectively interpreted in the context of the current literature? |  |  |
| Is there sufficient evidence to enable acceptance or rejection of the initial hypothesis? |  |  |
| Has the significance of the findings been clearly stated and explained? |  |  |
| Are the claims for the significance of the research and the conclusions drawn justified? |  |  |
| **References** |  |  |
| Do all the references match with the in-text citations? |  |  |
| Have the authors cited a relevant range of references, including current research? |  |  |
| **Title and Abstract** |  |  |
| Does the Title give a clear indication of the nature of the work? |  |  |
| Does the Abstract give an accurate summary of the work done? |  |  |
| If read on its own, would the Abstract allow the reader to understand the question(s) being asked, the core findings and their significance? |  |  |
| Are the summary statements of findings and their significance justified in the detailed descriptions in the paper? |  |  |